



January 20, 2017

Ref: 13554.00

Ms. Emily Wentworth
Senior Planner : Zoning/Special Projects
Town of Hingham
210 Central Street
Hingham, MA 02043

Attn: Jeffrey Dirk, PE, PTOE, FITE

Re: Final Response to Comments
VAI Traffic and Site Plan Engineering Review
Broadstone Bare Cove - 230 Beal Street
Hingham, Massachusetts

Dear Emily:

This letter provides additional information and responds to comments raised in a letter dated, January 9, 2017 from Jeffrey S. Dirk, PE, PTOE, FITE of Vanasse & Associates to your office (attached). VAI's letter focuses on responding and commenting on letters issued by VHB and Allen & Major, Inc on November 2nd and November 10, 2016 as well as information that had provided on a revised set of site plans issued on January 4, 2017 that had responded to the traffic engineering and site layout issues raised previously.

This letter provides responses and clarification to those comments for your information and commitments from the Applicant to undertake the actions noted in the VAI letter. In situations where the reviewer indicated "no responses required", this letter does not expand upon it any further. Attached to this letter are a number of attachments as well, including an updated set of civil engineering drawings for the site.

VAI COMMENT #1 :: *All Signs and pavement markings to be installed within the Project site shall conform to the applicable specifications of the Manual on Uniform Traffic Control Devices (MUTCD). This note should be added to the Site Plans.* **Applicants Initial Response:** The requested note has been added to the revised Comprehensive Permit Plans (Note 8 on Sheet No.'s C-2A and C-2B). **VAI Follow-Up Comment:** *The note should be corrected to read "All signs...."*

RESPONSE : Note #8 was revised to read "All signs..." on Sheets C-2A and C-2B.

101 Walnut Street
PO Box 9151
Watertown, Massachusetts 02471
P 617.924.1770
F 617.924.2286

Engineers | Scientists | Planners | Designers



VAI COMMENT #2 :: *Snow windrows within the sight triangle areas of the Project site driveway shall be promptly removed where such accumulations would exceed 2.5-feet in height. VAI Follow-Up Comment: A note should be added to the Comprehensive Permit Plans to indicate this requirement (See Comment 9 under Comprehensive Permit Plans).*

RESPONSE :: The Applicant's site engineer, Allen & Major Associates, added the note on Sheet C-7A stating, "Snow windrows located within the sight triangle areas that exceed 2.5-feet in height or that would otherwise inhibit sight lines shall be promptly removed."

VAI COMMENT #3 :: *Weather protected bicycle storage should be provided in secure areas within the parking garage of each building. Applicant's Initial Response: The revised Comprehensive Permit Plans indicate that parking for 40 bicycles will be provided in a secure area in the parking garage beneath Building 2. VAI Follow-Up Comment: Wayfinding signs should be provided within the Project site to indicate the location of the secure bicycle parking area. No further response required.*

RESPONSE :: Three wayfinding signs were added to the plans: one on the right as you enter the site, one on the right as you approach the right-hand turn to the move in/loading area, and one at the island between the move in area and the garage entrance. Call outs indicate signs shall read "Move in/unloading area" and "bicycle parking."

VAI COMMENT #4 :: *Route 3A/Beal Street – The Applicant should evaluate alternatives to reduce the width of the right-turn slip-ramp from Route 3A eastbound to Beal Street in order to reduce the speed of vehicles transitioning from Route 3A to Beal Street. Alternatively, this evaluation could include the introduction of a raised median along Beal Street between Route 3A and Sgt. William B. Terry Drive that would be similar to the landscaped median that has been constructed south of Sgt. William B. Terry Drive. Applicant's Initial Response: The Applicant's engineer indicated that they will evaluate the transition from Route 3A to Beal Street, the installation of a raised median and other appropriate treatments that are designed to reduce vehicle travel speeds along Beal Street. VAI Follow-Up Comment: These treatments should be developed at a conceptual level and presented to the ZBA.*

RESPONSE : The Applicant has developed a plan showing a median divided gateway area in front of the project site along Beal Street. This improvement is engineered to address the vehicle speeds along Beal Street and focus on the transition as drivers exit the arterial nature of Route 3A and transition to the more residential/recreational uses along Beal Street.

VAI COMMENT #5 :: *The Applicant's engineer provided a truck turning analysis for the Town of Hingham Fire Department design vehicle (tower truck). The turning analysis demonstrated that the subject vehicle*



can access and circulate within the Project site in an unimpeded manner; however, we note that the fire truck would need to back-up to exit the drive aisle along the east side of Building 1. A review of this maneuver indicates that the distance exceeds 150-feet and would require that an approved turnaround area be provided in accordance with NFPA® 1. This area should be added to the Comprehensive Permit Plans and a revised turning analysis provided. The Applicant's engineer provided a truck turning analysis for the Fire Department design vehicle that illustrated that the subject vehicle can enter the Project site and exit by way of the gated connection to the Back River Wildlife Sanctuary. **VAI Follow-Up Comment: The analysis did not address access along the east side of Building 1 which was the subject of the comment. The Applicant should indicate how this comment has been addressed.**

RESPONSE: The applicant's site engineer (Allen & Major) has reviewed this item with the Fire Department. Attached to this letter is a document from the Fire Department noting that they will allow the backup maneuver in lieu of an approved turnaround area as the 'Authority Having Jurisdiction'. Additionally, the truck turning analysis has been updated to address the access along the east side of Building 1.

VAI COMMENT #6 :: *The Applicant's engineer should provide a turning analysis for an SU-30/40 (small delivery/moving vehicle and trash/recycling vehicle) that demonstrates that the subject vehicle can access and stage in the loading areas without blocking internal circulation. In addition, the analysis should also demonstrate the location and maneuvering required to serve the trash/recycling area.*

VAI Follow-Up Comment: The Applicant has not provided a response to this comment.

RESPONSE: Sheet C-7B has been added to the plan set and provides truck turning analysis a SU-40 vehicle and garbage truck.

VAI COMMENT #7 :: *It is not clear from the Comprehensive Permit Plans if a crosswalk is proposed for crossing Beal Street at the Project site driveway; a wheelchair ramp is shown on the southeast corner. If a crossing is to be provided, the Applicant's engineer should verify that the necessary lines of sight are provided and the design should include curblines extensions (bump-outs) or a raised median (discussion follows), ADA compliant wheelchair ramps on both sides of the crossing and pedestrian crossing warning signs at and in advance of the crossing.* **Applicant's Initial Response:** The Applicant's engineer provided a revised driveway design that includes a crossing of Beal Street at the Project site driveway. **VAI Follow-Up Comment: The current driveway design, including the pedestrian crossing of Beal Street, requires revisions to meet engineering design standards. VAI has provided design guidance to the Applicant's engineer on the required modifications and will be participating in a working session that is being scheduled with the Applicant to reconcile the driveway design and the associated improvements along Beal Street which will then be presented to the ZBA.**

RESPONSE :: A revised driveway design has been developed and reviewed by VHB's traffic engineers and A&M civil engineers. The plans meet standard engineering design practices and provides for a median divided island, a pedestrian crossing of Beal Street, a right-turn exit movement out of the site driveway, and on-street parking and sidewalk options.



VAI COMMENT #8 :: *Consideration should be given to providing a sidewalk along the south side of Beal Street between the Project site driveway and the driveway to the Back River Wildlife Sanctuary. The Applicant's engineer indicated that a connection to the Wildlife Sanctuary will be provided from within the Project site.* **VAI Follow-Up Comment:** **We continue to suggest that providing a sidewalk along the south side of Beal Street between the Project site driveway and the driveway to the Back River Wildlife Sanctuary is advantageous and would serve to provide a continuous sidewalk along the south side of Beal Street between Lynch Field and the Wildlife Sanctuary.**

RESPONSE: Alliance has agreed to make significant pedestrian infrastructure improvements to provide direct linkage to proximate destinations including the Lynch Fields, the signalized intersection at Beal/Sgt Terry and the Lincoln Plaza (crosswalk w refuge). Alliance also proposes to construct pedestrian linkage to Bare Cove Park via a new pedestrian boardwalk, as well as Sheltry Path. Given the existing parking area at the head of Sheltry Path (a/k/a Lynch Field lot) directly abutting the subject site, and creation of direct linkages leading to the abutting park, we do not foresee a pedestrian movement - away from these significant park parking and access amenities - towards a sidewalk along Beal Street that leads to a parking area serving park visitors arriving by automobile. Moreover, we do not foresee a pedestrian movement from the west Bare Cove Park parking lot east to the Alliance curb opening.

VAI COMMENT #9 :: *The corner radius for vehicles exiting the Project site should be redesigned as a compound curve and the raised channelizing island extended parallel to and off-set from the edge of the travelled-way on Beal Street in order to reinforce the left-turn restriction while continuing to accommodate fire truck egress. Further, a raised median should be installed along Beal Street extending from the Project site driveway southerly to Sgt. William B. Terry Drive in order to eliminate the potential for U-turn maneuvers along this segment of Beal Street and to reduce travel speeds approaching the Project site driveway. The raised median should be designed and constructed so as to be consistent with the raised median that exists to the south of Sgt. William B. Terry Drive (width and plantings).* **VAI Follow-Up Comment:** **As stated previously, VAI has provided design guidance to the Applicant's engineer on the required modifications to the driveway design and will be participating in a working session that is being scheduled with the Applicant.**

RESPONSE: The Applicant has revised the plan to show a median divided section of Beal Street that will address the U-turn concerns raised, slow down drivers as they transition from a commercial area to the residential/recreational area, and provide for a safe pedestrian crossing of Beal Street. The plans are attached to this letter as Exhibit A.

VAI COMMENT #10 :: *A "No Left-Turn" sign (graphic symbol) should be installed on Beal Street facing motorists exiting the Project site.* **VAI Follow-Up Comment:** **The requested sign should be added to the revised driveway design.**



RESPONSE: The plans have been revised to include a “no left turn” sign (graphic symbol).

VAI COMMENT #11 :: *A school bus waiting area should be provided within the Project site or at an appropriate location defined in consultation with the Town of Hingham School Department.*

Response: The Applicant has been working with the Town of Hingham School Department to identify the location of the school bus waiting area for the Project. Four (4) potential locations for the waiting area have been discussed that include two (2) locations within the Project site, a location along the north side of Beal Street and use of the existing drop-off/pick-up area within the Lynch Fields parking lot. Based on these discussions, use of the existing drop-off/pick-up area within the Lynch Fields parking lot has been identified as the preferred option. The Comprehensive Permit Plans include a sidewalk connection to the Lynch Fields parking lot that would provide access to the drop-off/pick-up area. **VAI Follow-Up Comment: Should the Lynch Fields parking lot continue to be advanced as the school bus drop-off/pick-up area for the Project, the Applicant should consider providing lighting along the sidewalk to the parking lot.**

RESPONSE: John W. Ferris, Director of Business and Support Services for the Hingham Public Schools, has issued a confirmation that the School Department will utilize the existing Bus Drop-off and Pick-Up located at the Lynch Field Lot for the transportation of school age children residing at Broadstone Bare Cove. That confirmation, dated January 20, 2017, has been submitted to the Board.

VAI COMMENT #12 :: *A “No Left-Turn” sign (graphic symbol) should be installed on Beal Street facing motorists exiting the Project site. VAI Follow-Up Comment: The requested sign should be added to the revised driveway design.*

RESPONSE: The plans have been revised to include a “no left turn” sign (graphic symbol).

VAI COMMENT #13 :: *The sight triangle areas for the Project site driveway intersection with Beal Street should be added to the Site Plans along with a note to indicate: “Signs, landscaping and other features located within the sight triangle areas shall be designed, installed and maintained so as not to exceed 2.5-feet in height. Snow windrows located within the sight triangle areas that exceed 2.5-feet in height or that would otherwise inhibit sight lines shall be promptly removed.” VAI Follow-Up Comment: The Applicant has not provided a response to this comment.*

RESPONSE: The sight distance triangles for the site driveway intersection with Beal Street were added to the Fire Truck Turning Plan (Sheet C-7A) along with a note stating “signs, landscaping and other features located within the sight triangle areas shall be designed, installed and maintained so as not to exceed 2.5-feet in height. Snow windrows located within the sight triangle areas that exceed 2.5-feet in height or that would otherwise inhibit sight lines shall be promptly removed.”



VAI COMMENT #14 :: Comment 10: *A tenant move in/out management plan (narrative) should be provided and reflected in the truck turning analysis for the Project.* **VAI Follow-Up Comment:** **The Applicant has not provided a response to this comment.**

RESPONSE: All tenant move-ins and move-outs will be coordinated with the property management staff on site in the leasing office prior to the move-in/move-out date. The property management staff will keep a schedule of upcoming move-ins/move-outs to ensure efficient usage of dedicated move in/out areas including loading areas and elevators. On the move-in/move-out date, the property management staff will direct the tenant to the appropriate move-in/move-out locations where the moving truck can be parked and unloaded. Each building has its own, separate move-in/move-out area (which are marked on the Comprehensive Permit Plans). The area for building 1 is located at the southeast corner of the building outside on the surface parking lot. The area is clearly marked with “zebra” striping. The area for building 2 is located at the southwest corner of the building.

VAI COMMENT #15 :: *A narrative should be provided describing how trash and recycling will be collected and then picked-up by the contracted hauler.* **VAI Follow-Up Comment:** **The Applicant has not provided a response to this comment.**

RESPONSE: Waste and recycling will be deposited by community residents on each floor in designated waste/recycling rooms. Separate chutes at each location for recycling and garbage will terminate in collection rooms in the sub-grade garages. Garbage and recycling will be separately collected and stored in bins indoors in each building until scheduled pickups from a professional waste hauler remove the waste from site.

Prior to scheduled pickups, on-site property management will pull the rolling bins out from storage to designated collection areas, namely at the southeast corner of building 1, and the southwest corner of building 2. Bins will then be pulled back into the waste/recycling collection rooms until they are filled, and ready for the next scheduled pick up.

VAI COMMENT #16 :: *The Applicant’s engineer should provide parking demand observations from residential apartment communities in a similar setting with comparable access to public transportation services in order to support the requested waiver from the Zoning By-Law. We note that the parking ratio that is proposed is within the range of values documented by the Institute of Transportation Engineers (ITE)³ for an apartment community in a suburban setting.* The Comprehensive Permit Plans have been revised to provide 440 parking spaces that will serve 220 apartment units, or a parking ratio of 2.0 spaces per residential unit, which complies with Section V-A, *Off-Street Parking Requirements*, of the Hingham Zoning By-Law. **VAI Follow-Up Comment:** *we note that the updated waiver list states that*

Ms. Emily Wentworth
Ref: 13554.00
January 3, 2017
Page 7



the Applicant is seeking a waiver to provide a parking ratio of 1.55 spaces per dwelling unit. The Applicant should clarify the number of parking spaces that are proposed for the Project and reconcile the materials that have been submitted in support of the Project. We support the waiver to reduce the length of the parking spaces within the garages from 20-feet without an overhang to 18-feet without an overhang given that the circulating aisles within the garage are a minimum of 24-feet in width and will afford sufficient maneuvering area for vehicles to enter and exit the subject spaces with the reduced parking space length.

RESPONSE : A&M has revised the parking table to more clearly state that there are 440 parking stalls required (ratio of 2:1) and 340 parking stalls proposed (ratio of 1.55:1).

We trust that the above information is helpful to address the open questions. If you have any questions on the attached, please feel free to contact me at your convenience.

Sincerely,

Vanasse Hangen Brustlin, Inc.

A handwritten signature in blue ink, appearing to read "Robert L. Nagi", with a long, sweeping underline.

Robert L Nagi, PE

Principal

CC: Michael Boujoulian, Alliance;
Carlton Quinn, Allen & Major Associates;
Jeffrey Tocchio, DTM Attorneys at Law